

AN ALTERNATIVE DISCOURSE: CRIME, CRIMINALS, AND VICTIMS IN *MUNDIAL '78: LA HISTORIA PARALELA*

KIMBERLY LOUIE*

ABSTRACT. *Mundial '78: la historia paralela* is an important cultural documentary that exposes the Argentine dictatorship's use of an international monumental sporting event to hide torture, kidnappings, and assassinations of its citizens. In order to analyze the film, this study examines the evolution of new journalism, nonfiction narrative, and hardboiled fiction in order to demonstrate how discursive strategies found in these styles are used in the film. Emphasizing the severe social critique the film makes about the Argentine dictatorship (1976-83), it becomes evident that this is an alternative discourse to the official story told by the government. It serves, in the end, in the construction of a national memory that refuses to forget about the crimes against humanity committed by this dictatorship.

KEY WORDS: Latin American documentary film, hardboiled, nonfiction narrative

Hosting a monumental world-sporting event brings international recognition to the country, its society, and its government. Putting the country's best face forward is paramount while in the spotlight as it offers an unusual platform to communicate with the entire world. Abusing the forum to hide genocide or other humanitarian crimes has been seen throughout history by corrupt governments. As *Mundial '78: la historia paralela* (2003)¹, by Argentine directors Gonzalo Bonadeo, Diego Guebel, and Mario Pergolini, begins, one is quickly reminded of the 1936 Berlin Olympic Games. Hitler utilized this international setting to portray a stable and strong country that was not involved in crimes against humanity.² Likewise, the Mexican gov-

* KIMBERLY LOUIE (PhD) is Assistant Professor of Spanish at Southeast Missouri State University. Her research focuses on contemporary Latin American women journalists that use their style texts. E-mail: klouie@semo.edu.

1 *Mundial '78* aired for the first time on *Telefé* on June 28, 2003. Miriam Molero states the next day in *La Nación* that the film, "se distingue de las miradas ofrecidas con anterioridad [...] este documental es la madurez con que abordó cada uno de los aspectos de la época y la adulez con que organizó los testimonios, desde la abuela de Plaza de Mayo Estela de Carlotto hasta Juan Alemann. [...] la investigación fue lograr, a lo largo de una hora televisiva, que el espectador se acercara a una verdad equilibrada, liberada de la visión maniqueísta del blanco y negro" ("Adulta historia").

2 To begin his book, *Hitler's Games: The 1936 Olympics* (1986), Duff Hart-Davis opens: "In staging the eleventh modern Olympiad in Berlin on a colossal scale, Adolf Hitler, Chancellor of the Third Reich, exploited a unique opportunity to the full. By acting as

ernment killed student and civilian protesters before hosting the Olympic Games in 1968.³ Furthermore, the Argentine military regime (1976-83) took advantage of the 1978 World Cup to deny any involvement in the torture and genocide of its citizens, extending its time in power, as some believe.⁴ Therefore, it is absolutely relevant and intuitive for the directors of *Mundial '78* to highlight this event in their documentary in order to enter into the discussion surrounding the humanitarian crimes committed during the dictatorship and in particular about the *desaparecidos*, disappeared, and the tortured. This study analyzes this documentary, a highly important cultural work, under the framework established by new journalism and hard-boiled fiction in order to demonstrate the way in which this particular form of nonfiction reveals crime, the criminals, and in essence prosecutes those involved, illustrating a larger social critique of the government. As an alternative discourse to the official story, this documentary exposes crimes committed against humanity and reveals the power that an international sporting event has on hiding the atrocities.

host to 52 foreign nations during the first two weeks of August, 1936, he was able to persuade the world that New Germany, which he himself had raised from the ashes of the Weimer Republic, was a well organised, modern and above all civilised society. Visitors who went to the festival came away enormously impressed, not only by the Olympic preparations, which were on a scale never seen before, but also by the fact that Germany seemed a perfectly normal place, in which life went on as pleasantly as in any other European country. Many of them concluded that the tales they had heard about persecution of Jews, Catholics and political dissidents must have been grossly exaggerated" (Hart-Davis, 1986: 9). The ability to hold a forum that shielded the reality of Germany from the international public was clearly accomplished, much like one will see with Argentine World Cup. Additionally, the censorship of newspapers would be absolute under the Hitler government. According to Christopher Hilton, "[in] the winter of 1935 [...] Hitler held Germany in an iron grip. All news was heavily censored so that an ordinary citizen had no informed perspective about anything. German cultural and artistic life, once so wonderfully vibrant and challenging in so many spheres, lay dead; in its place Hitler put forth his hatred of Jews and communists" (Hilton, 2006: 27). Controlling the media is a crucial component to the success of the Argentine World Cup.

- 3 While there seems to be some debate among historians about the connection between the student massacre in the Plaza de Tres Culturas in the Tlatelolco region of Mexico City and the Olympic Games, Kevin B. Witherspoon argues that there are at least five significant ties between the two: "1) timing; 2) student rhetoric; 3) the security force that repressed the students was raised for the Olympics; 4) heightened media coverage; 5) the perception in international circles that the students were protesting the Olympics" (Witherspoon, 2008: 119).
- 4 Osvaldo Ardiles, midfielder for the Argentine team in 1978, communicates this message at the end of the documentary. More information about this player's testimony will be discussed later the study.

The 30,000 people that were disappeared during the Argentine dictatorship is a genocide. While the government officially recognizes 10,000, many sources augment that number to be three times larger. The massive scale of disappeared and their subsequent assassination is a case of an enormous crime against humanity. The criminals in this case are the military men of the dictatorship and the victims are those that were tortured, kidnapped and killed, and their families. Those that survived the torture have revealed their stories in many forms of testimony; amongst those, the media outlet of documentary. Similar to hardboiled fiction, nonfiction narratives have developed a new artistic arena capable of providing an emotional, yet objective, forum for investigative journalism. As seen in the great Spanish American narratives, *Operación masacre* (1957) by Rodolfo Walsh and *La noche de Tlateloloco* (1971) by Elena Poniatowska, evidence gathered through investigative journalist practices is later turned into narrative pieces that use fictional literary devices to create the story and are often classified under the heading of new journalism. Documentary film has developed out of this style and while not considered to be fiction, does implement similar strategies.

Due to this similarity, one is able to analyze documentary film in much the same way as fiction, in this case, hardboiled fiction. Detective fiction in its original framework had a classic formula. According to Ilan Stavans, the formula includes four principle components:

SUSPENSE, which the writer achieves through a slow and calculated revelation of information... THE USE OF TRADITIONAL DISCURSIVE TECHNIQUES, [in which] Detective narration is similar to the coherent, linear, conservative presentation of its plot, and it rejects the unconventional... THE CASE OF TYPICAL AND MANNEQUIN-LIKE CHARACTERS, which includes a reluctant, antisocial, but intelligent and suspicious detective, a sidekick (or a few) who seek the services of the investigator, usually a layperson or a scientist... MORALITY AND INTELLECT [in which] Reason always triumphs over irrationality and order over disorder (Stavans, 1997: 43-46).

While this work of Stavans deals primarily with Mexican detective fiction, one finds similar attributes given to the classical formula by other scholars.

One such scholar is Osvaldo Di Paolo, who has written extensively on this genre and the *novela negra hispanoamericana* (hardboiled Hispanic American fiction).⁵ Di Paolo and Nadina Olmeda state in *Gemidos* that the parameters of the *novela policial clásica*, “se centra en la intriga y el desencubrimiento de un crimen y se reduce al juego de la inteligencia. La narración gira en

5 Di Paolo has also written on crime films in his book *Cadáveres en el armario: el policial palimpsestico en la literatura argentina contemporánea* (2011).

torno al ‘misterio de cuarto cerrado’ derivado de un crimen, con el propósito de esclarecer sus motivos y la manera en que fue consumado, siempre dándole relevancia a la búsqueda de quién lo perpetró y cómo se efectuó el homicidio” (Di Paolo and Olmeda, 2015: 47). This classical formula shifts in the late 1950s with the emergence of texts defined as new journalistic. Often considered the first text of new journalism, *In Cold Blood* (1965) by Truman Capote, was in essence a narrative created out of investigative journalistic practices. It was, therefore, based on gathered evidence, but written as a novel. However, as critics began to explore this area of nonfiction writing in greater detail, extending the analysis south to Latin America, it becomes, and is generally agreed upon, that in fact Walsh’s *Operación masacre* (1957) precedes Capote’s text by nearly a decade (Di Paolo and Foster, 2013: 42).

David William Foster discusses the importance of this text in his article “Latin American Documentary Narrative” stating that Walsh’s text “is easily considered the most authentic example of documentary narrative in Latin American fiction [that] blends true materials gathered in his investigations and narrative strategies to make a rhetorically effective presentation of an actual event (Foster, 1984: 42). Conversely, as Di Paolo and Olmeda explain, in *Operación masacre*:

se evidencia la primera ruptura con el policial clásico. La obra de Walsh gira en torno al fracaso de un contragolpe militar a la dictadura de la llamada Revolución Libertadora en 1956, donde en un terreno descampado de José León Suárez [...] son fusilados varios civiles bajo la sospecha de formar parte de un alzamiento. Este rompimiento con el policial clásico—dónde se estructura la narración del crimen por medio de la lógica y la razón—constituye un elemento imprescindible para comprender su evolución hasta nuestros días. Se comienza a introducir elementos que reflejan la problemática social, política y económica en el mundo hispano, dando lugar a una nueva etapa en la evaluación del género policíaco: la novela negra (Di Paolo and Olmeda, 2015: 51).⁶

As indicated in both the evolution of detective fiction and nonfiction narratives works like Walsh’s and Capote’s changed the formula for writing about crime.

6 Amelia S. Simpson states about detective fiction from Latin America, “[in] the hard-boiled model there is more action than puzzling, violence and sex are less subject to censorship, the theme of organized crime is introduced, and a critical and often cynical view of society predominates. The conservative, aristocratic ideology of the classic model that presents the individual criminal act as an aberration in a basically stable, secure society contrasts sharply to the antielitism of the hard-boiled model with its distrust of institutions and its view of crime as all pervasive” (Simpson, 1990: 12). This idea of a cynical view of society that distrusts its institutions will be found throughout and reiterated again at the end of this study.

Documentary, therefore, serves as a visual depiction of, which includes, but is not limited to, an event, a person, or a crime. *Mundial '78* focuses on the latter by exposing the alternative discourse to this historical sporting event. This alternative discourse then can be understood as coming from the margin, the private, and the unofficial story. It utilizes the “official” story told by the Argentine government parallel to the marginalized voice in order to illustrate that what was being told to the world was in fact, a propagandistic lie. It is, as the title indicates, the private versus the public story.

The images used to represent the public side of the story are typically found through the use of archival footage, of the games themselves, the protests in the Plaza de Mayo, the speeches given by Jorge Rafael Videla, advertisements, and other media coverage of the event and through the testimony of Juan Alemann and César Luis Menotti, and the soccer players. In contrast, the images used to illustrate the private side of the story are testimonies, some archival footage, and recreations. The latter are used because there is no concrete visual evidence of the prisoners or their experiences in the ESMA (Escuela Superior de Mecánica de la Armada), which was one of the most brutal detention centers in the country where an estimated 5,000 people were killed (*The Disappeared*). Conversely, it is this detention center that is the focus of the documentary.

The only footage of the ESMA that can be used comes from images of the outside of the building. However, the use of archival footage is one of the most important and effective discursive strategies implemented by the directors. As the documentary begins, one sees footage of Jorge Rafael Videla, President of Argentina (1976-81), speaking before the games and various shots of the crowds inside the stadium, el Estadio River Plate, celebrating goals, jumping frantically, which are all shots intended to invoke emotions in the spectator. Juxtaposed to this footage is the background music, an ominous and energetic music with heavy electric guitar sounds that is employed to create suspense.

This type of suspense, while it would follow traditional literary suspense, is in some ways similar to that found in detective fiction. As the omniscient narrator, a voice over of Enrique Pinti, informs the viewer that the purpose of the film is to prove that the Argentine dictatorship used the World Cup to hide torture, kidnappings, and assassinations, one is prepared to hear the evidence. This is also indicative of Stavans second component to detective fiction, namely, that there is the use of traditional discursive technique. Stavans states: “The rejection of experimentation and the simplicity of discourse are also visible in the selection of narrative voice: nearly always third person, omniscient, or attached to one character, so the writer may achieve ‘objective’ perspective of the action” (Stavans, 1997: 45). The narrator functions as a character in the story, the detective. The detective’s role is to re-

veal the information to the spectator slowly as to maintain suspense, but also in order to arrive at a deductive, logical conclusion. The latter, while previously stated, still needs evidence.

As evidence is revealed, it is accompanied by music that is meant to influence the spectator. As aforementioned, the ominous sounds introducing Videla, other military, and the footage of the games themselves, will then subside and is often followed a slower, yet still dark style music that introduces one of the frequent sentiments found in the film, specifically, that people who celebrated the Argentine victory, were also subjected to the violence in one way or another. That is to say, the linear movement of the film towards the deductive conclusion is offset, or regresses, at times to allow for the official discourse to report its side of the story.⁷

The first instance of this regression appears early in the documentary as Claudio Morresi provides his testimony, an Argentine soccer player after 1978, who is sitting at the top of the bleachers in a now empty and quiet Estadio River Plate. He explains that he was at the 1978 World Cup as a spectator and remembers Videla present in the crowd. His brother had disappeared two years earlier and his fate was not exposed until 13 years later when the family found out six gunshot wounds killed him. The placement of this particular testimony allows for the documentary to extend to a larger audience by making the connection that those that were affected by this historical event, were not solely the victims in the ESMA. Many of the people that watched and participated in the World Cup 1978 were linked to the atrocities of the government. The idea of regression occurs because the spectator is being led towards the conclusion, but is interrupted by emotional testimony that reminds one as to the reasons why the event is so important. In this case, it also represents the contradictory experiences many had: happiness of the games shadowed by the despair for their loved ones.

However, the first testimony of the documentary is that of Graciela Daleo, an ESMA survivor, who starts her story by talking about the day of the final game between Holland and Argentina. With a 2-1 victory, almost everyone erupted in celebrations, including the military men at the ESMA. One of these men is Jorge “El Tigre” Acosta, captain of corvette and in charge of this particular detention center, describes the narrator. Daleo tells of how Acosta walked into where the prisoners were being held to tell them

7 Stavans describes the notion of suspense in detective fiction as not necessarily pertaining to fear and anxiety, but rather explains that the detective genre “is composed of progressions and regressions, at once centripetal and centrifugal, movements forward and backward that keep the tension in equilibrium. The writer premeditates them, plays with our logic and our conscience” (1997: 44). In this case, the documentary plays more on the viewer’s conscience as it continuously attempts to evoke emotion while revealing the progression of the crime.

they had won. She explains that from her point of view, no one was winning anything, as she knew that people were being tortured and families were looking for their loved ones. It was horrible to hear the sounds of celebration because neither she nor any other prisoners belonged to that world of joy, which they heard because the ESMA was only 1,000 meters from the stadium. Here the documentary implements a topographical map to show just how close the stadium was from the prisoners. As what may be considered psychological torture, some of the military men took some of the prisoners out with them to celebrate in the streets of Buenos Aires. Amongst the cheers, as the reenactment demonstrates, she stuck her head out of the sun roof of the vehicle and she recalls that she had never felt so alone, she knew that if she disappeared right then and there, no one would even notice.

In order to visualize her experience, the documentary implements recreations. Bill Nichols explains “[reenactments] vivify the sense of the lived experience, the *vécu*, of others. They take past time and make it present. They take present time and fold it over onto what has already come to pass. They resurrect a sense of a previous moment that is now seen through a fold that incorporates the embodied perspective of the filmmaker and the emotional investment of the viewer” (Nichols, 2008: 88).⁸ As a discursive strategy of documentaries, reenactments allow the filmmaker to capture that that has no visual evidence. As a form of new journalism, these reenactments, in particular ones about the ESMA, create another level of emotion in the viewer, typically that of sympathy for the victim. As Daleo explains her story, the spectator is taken into a dark room with only metal beds and people tied to them. The slow ominous music again creates suspense, as one visually perceives the darkness of the dungeon like room while hearing the voice of Daleo.

As the suspense subsides, Daleo concludes her testimony and the documentary shifts immediately back to the official side of the story. As the narrator lays the groundwork for the next testimony, the spectator is given the information that in order to have near complete control over the organization of the event, the government created Ente Autárquico Mundial (EAM) (Self Sufficient Entity). The first president of EAM the general Omar Actis was assassinated, the circumstances are still unexplained and his death was ultimately attributed to terrorists, and the presidency was given to his successor Carlos Lacoste. The narration continues and speaking as an authori-

8 Regarding reenactments, Kristen Fuhs describes that “[like] reenactments in documentary, facts are presented and reconstructed at trial in order to produce a particular, and persuasive view of reality” (Fuhs, 2012: 53). This persuasive view of reality is another element to reenactments in *Mundial '78* as they intend to persuade the spectator of the case against the military.

tative voice,⁹ Juan Alemann, former Secretary of the Treasury Department, explains the economics behind the games. Lacoste spent a total of 700 million dollars on the event building new stadiums throughout the country.

The testimony of Juan Alemann, as it represents the official side of the story, serves as an entry point into the characters of detective fiction. Stavans describes that “[from] moral and psychological perspectives, the characters are archetypal caricatures of good, evil, reason, stupidity, or violence” (Stavans, 1997: 45). In *Mundial '78* there are images of clearly evil and violent characters, such as Videla, Massera, Lacoste, Kissinger, and other military men, and then there is testimony from Alemann. While the testimony from him in this particular documentary may not reveal the entire side of evil with which he has been associated, he formed a part of the governmental structure that is on trial in this case.¹⁰ The characters that represent good, conversely, are the victims that were subjected to the evil characters, including many of the players, the mothers of the disappeared, and the ESMA survivors. The detective, or narrator, is the character of reason as he reveals information that deductively arrives at the conclusion that the military dictatorship is guilty of exploiting the games to hide their corruption and violence.

As a figure of the dictatorship, Alemann’s testimony is an important voice. The significance of his discourse is to emphasize the economic impact of hosting a world event such as this. It is not just about the stadiums that were built, but also more importantly, the international forum the military government had access to and exploited. Large amounts of money were used in creating propaganda that alleged there were no secret detention centers, no tortures, no killings, basically, no internal conflict. For example, some of the slogans were: “Mostramos al mundo cómo somos los argentinos” and “Los argentinos somos derechos y humanos.” The documentary flashes these propagandistic images in order to provide evidence of the direct manipulation of the media that hid humanitarian atrocities. Despite the Netherlands call to boycott the games, in the end, not a single team re-

9 Mikhail Bakhtin explains that the authoritative word “demands that we acknowledge it, that we make it our own; it blinds us, quite independent of any power it might have to persuade us internally; we encounter it with its authority already infused” (Bakhtin, 1981: 342). This indicates, additionally, that it does not permit the possibility for other interpretations (1981: 344).

10 Some of Alemann’s claims about the dictatorship will be revealed further in the study when the disappeared children are highlighted. It is important to note that Alemann in this documentary is a figure of someone that opposed the games due to the economic costs. In the archives of *El País*, published on February 16, 1978, the article states that Alemann accused the EAM of incorrectly informing the government of the cost of the World Cup, which had been reported at 100,000 million dollars. Alemann knew the cost would be much more substantial, 700 million dollars (“El Mundial costará”).

moved themselves from the competition (Stevenson). It was rumored at the time that Johan Cruyff, playing for Holland, and West Germany's Paul Breitner both refused to take part, but 30 years later the former revealed his actual reasons for not participating (Stevenson, 2010). Cruyff states that he and his family were kidnapped a few months before the game, which changed his perspective on life, resulting in his absence from the World Cup (Keeley, 2008). The fact that no one boycotted the games reflects the absolute control of the media that Argentina accomplished.

There was at one point a media campaign against Argentina, as the documentary highlights, led by Pierre Grenet. The dictatorship understood this as a campaign *anti-argentino*, which the narrator reveals over images of the anti-Argentina propaganda, such as, a gun shooting a bullet through the globe with a goalie catching a soccer ball on the other side or a soccer ball sitting on top of rifles. Therefore, Admiral Emilio Eduardo Massera, in charge of the ESMA, established a series of offices, *la pecera*, inside the building to combat the media coverage from the exterior of the abuses occurring in Argentina. One of the prisoners forced to work in those offices was Raul Cubas. Cubas is an ESMA survivor, a caricature of good, and was assigned to checking all of the international news coverage. During his testimony he explains that he had to attend a press conference with Coach César Luis Menotti, who was back then and is now openly affiliated with the communist party, to get a quote. After debating whether or not to tell Menotti he was a disappeared, his fear kept him silent. Fear and silence are two of the most prominent elements seen in cultural productions dealing with this Argentine dictatorship and others repressive regimes in Latin America.

According to Susana Kaiser, there was a reason some of the tortured were let free: to spread the word and install fear in the populace (Kaiser, 2005: 44). Likewise, intertwined in fear is silence. Kaiser explains that the “imposed social silence was one of the mechanisms to strengthen terror. [...] Silence intensified feelings of panic and was adopted by people as a condition for survival—their own or that of the missing persons (in the case of relatives of the disappeared)” (2005: 65). Throughout much of the testimonial work now available from people who lived through the dictatorships, the impending threat of death resulted in a society gripped by fear and silence. It was due to Cubas’ fear and thus silence that he could not speak to Menotti about the fact that he was a disappeared person. However, he was able to appear in a photograph from the interview with Menotti that then appeared in *La Nación*, which the documentary shows. This was his way of hoping people would see him in the photo and they would know that he was still alive. Cubas explains, similar to Daleo, that even though he is there, in reality, he does not belong to this world (*Mundial '78*).

The feeling of not pertaining to the outside world is found again in the testimony given by Estela de Carlotto, president of the Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo, as she speaks about her experience. She explains that as her family and friends gathered in her house to watch the final game and celebrated goals and the win, she and her husband were crying. Every goal, every cheer, meant that people had forgotten that others were being tortured and had gone missing and parents and grandparents were looking for their family members. The cheers were louder than the cries of the tortured. Estela de Carlotto and her husband's pregnant daughter, Laura, was disappeared in 1974 and at the time of the documentary, had still not found their missing grandson, Guido. There is an estimated 500 missing children, of which 119¹¹ have been found to date, amongst those Guido, who was the 114th disappeared child to be located in 2014.¹² Naturally, one finds contradictory "official" reports of the number of kidnapped children, as is the case in the in *The Disappeared* where the military men claim there are only 8: 2 by police and 6 by the terrorist themselves.¹³

Alongside the testimony of de Carlotto, the documentary offers a myriad of voices. Some of those are the actual *fútbol* players for the 1978 Argentine and Peruvian teams. The Peruvian players highlight a crucial aspect of the story. The narrator prepares the spectator for more testimony, revealing that 27 years later many Peruvian players doubt the transparency of what events surrounded this game. It was in the semi-final game that Argentina needed four goals to proceed to the finals. Argentina easily won by beating Peru 6-0. There are, therefore, suspicions of a scandal that the Peruvian

11 One can see a complete list of the grandchildren found on the Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo website. <https://www.abuelas.org.ar/caso/buscar?tipo=3>. Ignacio de los Reyes also has an article on the 119th grandson found, Mario Bravo, who was actually able to meet his 59 year old mother. http://www.bbc.com/mundo/noticias/2015/12/151201_argentina_nieto_119_mario_bravo_sara_irm.

12 De los Reyes also has an article on this monumental moment for Estela de Carlotto, a prominent figure of the abuelas who has dedicated her life to finding justice and the missing people. http://www.bbc.com/mundo/noticias/2014/08/140805_argentina_estela_carlotto_guido_busqueda_nieto_irm.

13 Alejandro Dandan explains the case against Alemann: "Alemann no está imputado por apropiación de niños, pero la fiscalía trajo a la audiencia el tema al rescatar una entrevista que, sin embargo, permite ver las oscuridades de su alma. 'Hubo 200 y pico de casos de mujeres que tuvieron hijos en cautiverio y después las liquidaron—dice Alemann en ese texto. De esos, unos 200 los entregaron a los jueces y quedaron menos de 30 casos que se distribuyeron entre familias de militares. Eran chicos que sobraban, porque esos guerrilleros constituían parejas y mientras peleaban tenían hijos. Era una irresponsabilidad. Pero no hubo robo de chicos. Hay que tener estómago para hacerse cargo del hijo de un guerrillero.'" ("El caso"). This reiterates the "official" side of the story in that there was no kidnapping of children and illustrates a more sinister side of Alemann. http://www.bbc.com/mundo/noticias/2014/08/140805_argentina_estela_carlotto_guido_busqueda_nieto_irm.

team was paid off to lose the game. In order to collaborate this claim, the documentary implements testimony from Juan Carlos Oblitas, from the Peruvian team in 1978, who says this experience was unlike anything ever before. He explains that Videla and Henry Kissinger, former Secretary of State to the United States, psychologically played them before the game began as they visited them in the locker room. Here, the documentary implements news coverage of Kissinger and Videla speaking to the players.

As the discourse continues, Oblita's testimony discusses further doubts that he has about the legitimacy of the game stating that he is suspects two Peruvian players in particular, Ramón Quiroga, the goalie, and Rodolfo Manzo, a defender, because they had won so easily. Quiroga, who also gives testimony and is actually an Argentina-born Peruvian player, denies the allegations saying that Peru was playing with many injured players. To confirm Oblita's statements, the documentary uses archival footage of the game to show the ease with which Argentina scored goals. Moreover, one sees a newspaper clipping that shows Argentina gave an extraordinary credit for grain to Peru 15 days after the game.¹⁴ Menotti denies the allegations of an illegal transaction stating in an interview that Peru was simply playing without their best players and with others injured.¹⁵ While he agrees that the military men of the dictatorship should be investigated, he does not think the World Cup is an appropriate platform. However, some of the Argentine players featured in the documentary, Julio Ricardo Villa, a midfielder, and Ubaldo Fillol, the goalkeeper, point out that they are left to speculate as to

14 The newspaper, *El País*, reports Videla gave a loan and 14,000 tons of grain to Morales Bermúdez, the Peruvian president in 1978 (Rebossio). http://deportes.elpais.com/deportes/2012/02/07/actualidad/1328602917_850215.html. According to Wright Thompsons' article, "While the World Watched", investigators have found that Argentina gave Peru 50 million dollars in aid and FIFA (International Federation of Association Football) opened an investigation into the games after a Peruvian senator gave testimony before an Argentine court in 2012, which is ongoing. http://espn.go.com/espn/feature/story/_/id/11036214/while-world-watched-world-cup-brings-back-memories-argentina-dirty-war.

15 Eduardo P. Archetti discusses the World Cup 1978, "[d]emocracy returned to Argentina in 1983. All of the members of the junta and many prominent figures were arrested and brought to justice. The atrocities were open to public scrutiny. It was obvious that Menotti and the players could no longer remain silent. The majority chose Menotti's explanation: they represented the people, and they played for the people" (Archetti, 2005: 143). The author continues to discuss figures such as Ricardo Villa and seems to reference some of the testimony found in *Mundial '78* telling the story of a survivor that was taken out of the ESMA to the streets to celebrate and stuck her head out of the sun roof (2005: 145). This chapter is from a book, *National Identity and Global Sports Events: Culture, Politics, and Spectacle in the Olympics and the Football World Cup* (2005), which also has a chapter by Allen Guttmann on the 1936 Berlin Olympic Games and another one by Claire and Keith Brewster discussing the 1968 Olympic Games in Mexico. See bibliography for more details.

the veracity of this particular World Cup game. Finally, Juan Alemann also discusses the bomb explosion that occurred in his house precisely at the moment of the fourth goal. Alemann references Massera as the possible culprit to the crime since he was known for bombs, even though they were usually used against the “subversives”. Therefore, one notes that there are many suspicious elements surrounding that game.¹⁶

The knowledge that the game may have been thrown and the knowledge of the governmental cover-up of the crimes provoked Julio Ricardo Villa to meet with one of the mothers of the disappeared 22 years after the World Cup. He felt it was the right thing to do since their cause was virtually ignored during the games.¹⁷ During the dictatorship, the Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo begged the international media to help them out with their struggle. This documentary employs one of the most iconic media coverage of the Abuelas in the Plaza de Mayo where one of the mothers is begging the journalists to help them out saying they are their only hope. In *Mundial '78*, it seems that this footage was taken during the games, but one finds in *Mala junta '76* (1999) that this is actually footage recorded in May 1980. This raises an interesting aspect to the portrayals in documentary film, where images are taken from a different moment and used as part of the discourse in another. This intentionally influences the spectator to sympathize with the mothers, which in a sense, is less objective than traditional journalism and more representative of new journalism and the emotional side of the story. In terms of the Hispanic hardboiled tradition, the effect of this footage aligns precisely with the overall social implications.

The social implication is one of severe criticism of the Argentina military dictatorship, its abuse of power, and the exploitation of an international sporting event. As the narrator clearly supports the alternative discourse, the spectator is encouraged to understand and side with the victims in this case. Mas'ud Zavarzadeh sustains in “Tales of Intelligibility” that in order for the spectator to grasp the political meaning of the film, he or she must understand the framing ideology (Zavarzadeh, 1991: 19). As has been

16 The article, “It WAS a fix: Peruvian senator reveals his country did throw a key 1978 World Cup game against Argentina”, claims that the “former Peruvian Senator Genaro Ledesma has confirmed that the shock result was agreed before the match by the dictatorships of the two countries. Mr. Ledesma, 80, made the accusations to Buenos Aires judge Roberto Oyarbide, who last week issued an order of arrest against former Peruvian Military president Francisco Bermudez. He is accused of illegally sending 13 Peruvian citizens to Argentina as part of the so-called Condor Plan, through which Latin American dictatorships in the 1970s cooperated in the repression of political dissidents” (Roper, 2012).

17 This information is part of Villa's testimony in the documentary, but is also seen in a conversational interview between Villa and Tati Almeida (“Una madre, un futbolista”). <http://edant.clarin.com/diario/2000/06/26/d-01202.htm>.

shown throughout this discussion, the framing ideology is that of the military and the political right. In addition, by specifying the private discourse of the story, it is clear that this is also understood as the story of marginalized. As Zavarzadeh points out, the marginalized sector is attempting to reestablish order in the dominant ideology (1991: 153). Although this can never be achieved, what a film such as this does in fact accomplish is a closing of the “gap” between the dominant and marginalized ideologies. It is as close to the power center as one can achieve constructing an alternative discourse to the official story about not only the World Cup '78 but also about the entire military dictatorship.

Often times, the marginalized are the focus of social documentary narratives and film. According to Julianne Burton, “[a] commitment to political transformation has indeed motivated much of Latin American social documentary production over the past four decades. Many filmmakers have found themselves acting, through the agency of their films, as advocates and accusers, agitators and dissenters—if not voluntarily, then compelled by the contradictions of their situation” (Burton, 1990: 27). In the case of *Mundial '78*, the directors have designed a discourse that is accusatory as it presents a legitimate case for the victims, not only through victim testimony but also by the research that went into finding archival footage, speeches, and newspaper clippings that demonstrate the official discourse as ultimately false. Naturally, as seen throughout the film, there is also a sense of agitation as some, in particular, Coach Menotti would disagree that this fits the forum to chastise the military dictatorship. Finally, as one returns to the notion of dissenter, again there is an instance of the margin receiving a voice through documentary narrative. Furthermore, extending past the documentary nature of the genre and revisiting the Hispanic hardboiled novel, this overlap is apparent. Amelia S. Simpson argues that it is precisely because of its “critical view of society” that the hard-boiled model “appears to be a more meaningful and adaptable form of detective fiction” (Simpson, 1990: 22).

Conclusions

Throughout the documentary, it has been evident that the formula of detective fiction is useful for understanding the film. The detective, or omniscient narrator, revealed the crime slowly through suspense and the presentation of characters deductively arriving at the truth. It was seen that reason triumphed over irrationality (Stavans, 1997: 45) and at the end, “truth and good dominate” (1997: 46), which illustrates the fourth component of Stavans detective fiction formula, morality and intellect. The nonfiction, new journalistic quality, which allows for objective investigative journalism to evoke the emotional side of the story through literary devices, creates a film considered to be hardboiled detective fiction. Adhering to the strong social

critique of this genre, it is evident that *Mundial '78* condemns the Argentine military dictatorship (1976-83) that used an international sporting event to hide the torture, kidnappings, and assassinations of its citizens. It shows how this singular event means two very different things for the Argentine society: one of great glory for some, who were proud of their country's success in the sport, and another sinister side that dehumanized, violated human rights, and marginalized a specific sector of the population. This is how Argentine society is dealing with the crimes of the dictatorship and aiding in the creation of a national memory that will assure that this type of tragedy will never happen again.

References

- Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo*, 2013. Retrieved on 16 March, 2016.
- Archetti, Eduardo P. "Argentina 1978: Military Nationalism, Football Essentialism, and Moral Ambivalence." In Alan Tomlinson and Christopher Young, eds., *National Identity and Global Sports Events: Culture, Politics, and Spectacle in the Olympics and the Football World Cup*, 133-47. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2005.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Edited by Michael Holquist. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1981.
- Brewster, Claire, and Keith Brewster. "Mexico City 1968: Sombreros and Skyscrapers." In Alan Tomlinson and Christopher Young, eds., *National Identity and Global Sports Events: Culture, Politics, and Spectacle in the Olympics and the Football World Cup*, 99-116. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2005.
- Burton, Julianne, ed. *The Social Documentary in Latin America*. Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1990.
- Dandan, Alejandra. "El caso contra Alemann." *Página/12*, 26 July, 2015. Retrieved on 15 March, 2016.
- De los Reyes, Ignacio. "Mario Bravo, el nieto 119 de las Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo en Argentina: 'Después de 38 años, mi mamá escuchó mi voz.'" *BBC Mundo*, Buenos Aires, 1 December, 2016. Retrieved on 14 March, 2016.
- De los Reyes, Ignacio. "La conmovedora historia de Estela de Carlotto, la Abuela de Plaza de Mayo que encontró a su nieto." *BBC Mundo*, Buenos Aires, 6 August, 2014. Retrieved on 1 March, 2016.
- Di Paolo, Osvaldo. *Cadáveres en el armario: el policial palimpsestico en la literatura argentina contemporánea*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Teseo, 2011.

- Di Paolo, Osvaldo. *Gemidos y explosiones apocalípticas poshumanas: la novella negra y de ciencia ficción hispana del siglo XXI*. Madrid: Ediciones Pliegos, 2013.
- Di Paolo, Osvaldo, and Nadina Olmedo. *Negrótico*. Madrid: Editorial Pliegos, 2015.
- “El Mundial costará a Argentina 56.000 millones de pesetas.” *El País*, 16 February, 1978. Retrieved on 22 March, 2016.
- Foster, David William. “Latin American Documentary Narrative.” *PMLA* 99.1 (1984): 41-55.
- Fuhs, Kristen. “Re-imagining the Nonfiction Criminal Narrative: Documentary Reenactment as Political Agency.” *Concentric: Literary and Cultural Studies* 38.1 (2012): 57-78.
- Guttman, Allen. “Berlin 1936: The Most Controversial Olympics.” In Alan Tomlinson and Christopher Young, eds., *National Identity and Global Sports Events: Culture, Politics, and Spectacle in the Olympics and the Football World Cup*, 65-81. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2005.
- Hart-Davis, Duff. *Hitler's Games: The 1936 Olympics*. New York, NY: Harper and Row, 1986.
- Hilton, Christopher. *Hitler's Olympics: The 1936 Berlin Olympic Games*. Stroud: Sutton Publishing Limited, 2006.
- Kaiser, Susana. *Postmemories of terror: a new generation copes with the legacy of the “Dirty War”*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005.
- Keeley, Graham. “After 30 years, the truth behind Cruyff's World Cup Absence.” *The Guardian*, 16 April, 2008. Retrieved on 19 March, 2016.
- Mala junta '76*. Dir. Eduardo Aleverti y Pablo Milstein. Videocasete. CREARS Productions, 1996.
- Molero, Miriam. “Adulta historia paralela.” *La Nación*, 28 June, 2003. Retrieved on 3 March, 2016.
- Mundial '78: la historia paralela*. Directed by Gonzalo Bonadeo, Diego Guebel, and Mario Pergolini. DVD. Ayer Nomás Producciones, Cuatro Cabeza, 2003.
- Nichols, Bill. “Documentary Reenactment and the Fantasmatic Subject.” *Critical Inquiry* 35.1 (2008): 72-89.
- Poniatowska, Elena. *La noche de Tlatelolco: testimonios de historia oral*. México: Ediciones Era, 1971.
- Rebossiuo, Alejandro. “La goleada del Plan Condor.” *El País*, 7 February, 2012. Retrieved on 3 March, 2016.
- Roper, Matt. “It was a fix: Peruvian senator reveals his country did throw key 1978 World Cup game against Argentina.” *DailyMail*, 10 February, 2012. Retrieved on 15 March, 2016.
- Scher, Ariel, and Carlos Prieto. “Una madre, un futbolista.” *Clarín*, 26 June, 2000. Retrieved on 14 March, 2016.

- Simpson, Amelia S. *Detective Fiction from Latin America*. Cranbury, NJ: Associated UP, 1990.
- Stavans, Ilan. *Antiheroes: Mexico and Its Detective Novel*. Cranbury, NJ: Associated UP, 1997.
- Stevenson, Jonathan. "The Story of the 1978 World Cup." *BBC.*, 18 May, 2010. Retrieved on 19 March, 2016.
- The Disappeared*. Directed and Produced by Peter Sanders. DVD. Eight Twelve Productions, 2007.
- Thompson, Wright. "While the World Watched." *ESPN*, 6 September, 2014. Retrieved on 3 March, 2016.
- Walsh, Rodolfo. *Operación masacre*. Buenos Aires: Ediciones Sigla, 1957.
- Witherspoon, Kevin B. *Before the Eyes of the World: Mexico and the 1968 Olympic Games*. DeKalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press, 2008.
- Zavarzadeh, Mas'ud. *Seeing Films Politically*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1991.